

Homework Assignment #13, Journal Club Presentation

This assignment is a *team* project; each person on the team will receive the same number of points for the assignment. Each team is responsible for fairly allocating the work among its members. If you believe a member of your team has not contributed proportionate effort, consult Professor Hughes or Celia.

NOTE THAT THE ASSIGNMENT CONSISTS OF MULTIPLE PARTS, EACH OF WHICH HAS ITS OWN DEADLINE.

1. Collaboratively, as a team, select a paper to present to the class. We recommend papers that have been published in *Physical Review Letters*, as they are shorter and have been selected by the editors as being accessible to all physicists. Submit the title and bibliographic citation information about the paper to phys496@physics.illinois.edu no later than **Friday, October 25**. You will receive feedback on the suitability of your choice. Early submission is encouraged, so if your first choice is unsuitable, you will have time to select another paper.
2. Prepare an oral presentation, to be delivered jointly by all members of the team, that describes and critiques your article. Use the [template](#) that was presented in class to model your presentation. Plan on **12 min to present and 3 min for questions**.
3. **Schedule a 30-min meeting** for at least two representatives of your team (everyone if possible) to meet with Professor Hughes to make sure you understand the physics. Be able to demonstrate your understanding of the paper or come with specific questions. Note that 35 of the total 100 “physics” points for the assignment will be based on this meeting. Arrange to meet with Professor Hughes between **October 28 and November 20**. **Do not put off this meeting until the last minute!** Doing so is not respectful of Professor Hughes’ time and will disadvantage your team.
4. **Email** a nearly final draft of your presentation to phys496@physics.illinois.edu **no later than noon, Monday, December 2—earlier is better**, for further physics and editorial suggestions. You will be given feedback on ways to improve your presentation. Note that 35 of the total 100 “communication” points for the assignment will be based on this draft.
5. **The final version of the talk must be emailed to** phys496@physics.illinois.edu **by NOON on December 6**.
6. Present your talk on **Friday, December 6** during class and answer audience questions about the paper. Each person on the team should present a proportional segment of the talk.

Your presentation must include the following elements:

- (i) A summary of the work reported in the article.
- (ii) A recap of the paper’s principal methods, results, and conclusions.
- (iii) A critical evaluation of the work reported. Did the authors answer the question they set out to resolve? Did they extend previous work? Did they justify their conclusions? Did you find any errors or ambiguities in the paper? Did the figures enhance the value of the

paper? Do you believe that the work is important, the results significant, and the conclusions valid?

- (iv) An assessment of the impact of the paper. How important was it to further developments in the field? (Look at the citation record.)

To give everyone equal time to present, the 15-minute total time limit will be strictly enforced. You should have no more than 6 or 7 “content” slides in your presentation to meet this time constraint. Points will be deducted from your team’s communication score if you either fail to use most of your time or exceed your allotted time. Rehearse—out loud—with one another.

Some form of standard presentation software should be used to prepare your slides; we recommend PowerPoint[®]. If you use some other program, provide a PDF file of your presentation to ensure compatibility with the A/V hardware in the classroom. Be sure to embed your fonts!

DUE DATES:

1. **Paper Selection—Friday, October 25.** Send the title and bibliographic citation for your selected paper to phys496@physics.illinois.edu by 9:00 p.m. for review.
2. **Team meeting with Professor Hughes—by 5:00 p.m., Wednesday, November 20.** (Contact Professor Hughes at least a week in advance of your preferred time to schedule the meeting. Don’t procrastinate!)
3. **Nearly finished presentation slides—Noon Monday, December 2,** emailed to phys496@physics.illinois.edu.
4. **Final presentation—Noon Friday, December 6.** Email the final version of your presentation to phys496@physics.illinois.edu by noon so it can be loaded on the classroom computer. Assignments submitted after the deadline will have points deducted. Upload the final version of your slides to my.physics by 9:00 p.m., Friday, December 6 for grading.

Total—200 points (100 physics, 100 communication)—Note that 35/100 “physics” points will be based on your team meeting with Professor Hughes, and 35/100 “communication” points will be based on your draft slides. If you miss the team meeting or fail to submit your draft slides, each member of the team will be penalized 35 points, respectively. This assignment is not eligible for rewrites.